



THE MULTISITE STUDY OF THE IMPLEMENTATION AND IMPACT OF SUPPLEMENTAL EDUCATIONAL SERVICES

REVIEW OF PROVIDER EFFECTS: DALLAS, MILWAUKEE AND MINNEAPOLIS

Patricia Burch, University of Southern California

Carolyn Heinrich, University of Texas – Austin

and the SESIQ² research team

Fall 2013

Acknowledgments

2

- **Funder:** Institute of Education Sciences, PR/Award number: R305A090301, Education Policy, Finance, and Systems Research Program, Goal 3
- **SESIQ² research team:** Carolyn Heinrich, Patricia Burch and Robert Meyer (co-PIs), Annalee Good, Mary Stewart, Esmeralda Garcia-Galvan, Huiping Cheng, Marcus Dillender, Hiren Nisar, Rudy Acosta, Emily Kao Kopfensteiner, Christi Kirshbaum, Jahni Smith, Brie Chapa
- **Study web page:** www.sesiq2.wceruw.org
- **Toll-free number:** 1-855-471-1700

District Partners

3

This research would not be possible without the cooperation of the following school districts:

- Chicago Public Schools
- Dallas Independent School District
- Los Angeles Unified School District
- Milwaukee Public Schools
- Minneapolis Public Schools

Quantitative Research Design

4

- Sample frame: students eligible for SES or other ELO programming and receiving services
- Data from standardized tests, administrative data bases for managing SES/ELO service provision, and district student transcript and demographic data
 - Used in constructing measures of service receipt, student-level controls to account for selection into programs and outcome measures (changes in tests scores)
- 2007-08, 2008-09, 2009-10, 2010-11 and 2011-12 data
- Primary model for estimating SES and provider effects: value-added model with student and school fixed effects

$$A_{jst} - A_{jst-1} = \alpha SES_{jt} + \beta X_{jt-1} + \pi_s + \delta_j + \mu_{gt} + \epsilon_{jst}$$

Summary of SES Provider Effects: Dallas Independent School District

5

Provider	Registered Students	Number in Analysis	Average hours tutored	Provider hourly rate	Market Share	Math Gain	Reading Gain	Effective for ELLs	
								Math	Reading
121 Tutor, LLC	68	40	13.6	59	0.4%	0.033	-0.307	no	no
1 on 1 Education	248	137	15.3	65	1.5%	0.065	0.015	no	no
1 to 1 Tutor	121	63	19.9	59	0.7%	0.258	-0.155	no	no
3 Commas Tutoring LLC	125	71	15	90	0.8%	0.200	-0.061	no	no
A+ Learning Academy inc	414	221	8.2	120	2.5%	0.017	-0.010	no	no
Aaron's Learning Center	113	80	16.1	n.a.	0.7%	0.141	-0.101	no	no
Academic Myriad	64	33	6.6	60	0.4%	-0.013	-0.293	no	no
Adaptive Learning, LLC	262	109	20.1	50	1.6%	0.217	-0.019	0.496	no
Allegiance Learning Solut	108	43	17.2	90	0.7%	0.444	0.092	no	no
Alternatives Unlimited, In	213	110	9.1	50	1.3%	0.076	-0.020	no	no
Ambriogio Academy, Inc.	148	53	18.2	50	0.9%	0.045	0.015	no	no
Apex Academics LLP	500	285	9.8	100	3.1%	0.229	-0.033	no	no
Babbage Net School, Inc.	85	43	10.4	70	0.5%	0.051	-0.055	no	no
CRMG Services, LLC	190	67	9.5	n.a.	1.2%	0.096	0.177	no	no
Champions Mind	608	284	17.1	90	3.7%	0.019	-0.248	no	no
Confidence Music	862	431	14.3	70	5.3%	0.224	0.006	0.488	no
Cool Kids Learn, Inc.	96	43	n.a.	n.a.	0.6%	-0.079	0.012	no	no
Cranium Maximus	86	51	14.9	80	0.5%	0.269	-0.213	no	no
Diverse Learning, Inc.	2,096	1,010	13.9	100	12.8%	0.144	-0.063	0.408	no
Educator Resources	292	138	11.5	n.a.	1.8%	0.507	0.071	0.364	no
Edutainment Learning	129	31	12.4	74	0.8%	0.529	-0.271	no	no
Focus First Tutoring	2,136	848	26.7	45	13.1%	0.097	-0.142	no	no
Group Excellence, Ltd.	2,240	1,367	11.9	n.a.	13.7%	0.138	-0.108	no	no
Knowledge Island Inc.	576	242	13.7	58	3.5%	0.108	-0.088	no	no
Learn-It System, LLC	150	69	13.4	90	0.9%	-0.024	-0.177	no	no
Markem, Inc.	81	65	14.3	89	0.5%	0.109	0.111	no	no
Omnipresent Tutoring	426	246	9.9	70	2.6%	0.029	0.012	no	no
Sheila Williams Lyons: Ac	487	230	8.6	157.5	3.0%	-0.112	-0.077	no	no
Studentnest, Inc.	108	44	20.4	65	0.7%	0.159	-0.069	no	no
System Xcellence, Inc: Ac	151	67	17.2	50	0.9%	0.078	-0.139	no	no
Tutors with Computers	2,252	975	13.1	92	13.8%	0.021	-0.043	no	no
Small Provider	884	334	n.a.	n.a.	5.4%	0.130	-0.040	no	no

Summary of SES Provider Effects: Milwaukee Public Schools

6

[illegible]

7

**Only ATS Project Success was also effective in 2008-09 or 2009-10.*

†A+ Tutoring Service, Ltd had a positive, statistically significant effect on reading gains for students with disabilities.

Contact information

www.sesiq2.wceruw.org

sesiq2@gmail.com

1-855-471-1700